



**Recommendations
of
National Human Rights Commission
on
Good Governance,
Development and Human Rights**

*[On the basis of National Workshop, held
on
21-22 September 2017 in New Delhi]*

NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

Manav Adhikar Bhawan, C-Block, GPO Complex

INA, New Delhi-110 023, India

Website : www.nhrc.nic.in



PREAMBLE

A National Seminar on “Good Governance, Development and Human Rights” was organized by the National Human Rights Commission on 21-22 September 2017 at New Delhi under the Chairmanship of **Justice Shri. H.L. Dattu, Hon’ble Chairperson** of NHRC. **Shri. Rajnath Singh, Hon’ble Union Home Minister** was the Chief Guest during the inaugural session on 21st September 2017 and Shri. **Ravi Shankar Prasad, Hon’ble Minister**, Ministry of Law & Justice and Electronics and Information Technology delivered the valedictory address on 22nd September 2017. This seminar was a culmination of three Regional Workshops organized at Shillong (Meghalaya) for the North-Eastern region, Bangalore (Karnataka) for the Southern region and in U.T. Chandigarh (Punjab) for the Northern region.

The objective of this Seminar was to raise awareness amongst all stakeholders about the importance of good governance in relation to human rights and development. This Seminar provided a platform to share the best practices amongst the States, identify the development gaps and how these gaps can be bridged at the grass root level, with focus on **Nyaya, Niti, Niyam and Neeyat**.

The Seminar was attended by the Chairpersons, Members, Secretaries of National Commissions & States Human Rights Commissions, Members of NHRC Core Group, Presenting Officers, Special Rapporteurs, Senior Officers from Union Ministries, State/ UTs and Governments, DGP’s/IGP’s, Resource persons, Members of Civil Society, Academicians, Research Scholars. Some of the major recommendations that emerged from the deliberations are given on the next page.



RECOMMENDATIONS

Sharing and Adoption of Best Practices amongst the States/UTs

1. Best practices of all states should be shared and uploaded on the State Portal; so that other states can replicate rather than reinvent the wheel. The best practices will further enable the states to learn from each other. For instance, **a) Medical Services Corporation Limited of Tamil Nadu** encourages transparency, accountability and quality of stores and this could be replicated by other States; **b) Right to hearing (Rajasthan)**, this is one of the major steps towards facilitation and good governance. It includes provisions for public hearing, setting up of information facilitation centers, citizen's care centers, call centres and help desks. This act provides an opportunity to the individual citizens for a time bound response. **c) e-PDS System of Chhattisgarh** has made PDS a success by using digitalization and automation with appropriate intervention of information and communication technology, thus, making it efficient, transparent and equitable. These good practices may be replicated by other States and UTs.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Maximize Governance and Minimize Government

2. The hallmark to minimize government and maximize governance is proactive investment in empowering the people. This includes simplification of procedures, identification and repeal of obsolete laws, identification and shortening of various applications and reporting forms like registration of house, opening of bank accounts, leveraging technology to bring in transparency in public interface and putting up a robust public grievance redress system in place. We need to reduce decision making layers to the minimum. This would help in building a knowledge economy, capacity building, digital literacy and infrastructure.

For instance, **a) P2G2 model** of Gujarat where the State government has made the government accountable to the masses: Accessibility, Decentralization, Efficiency, Innovation and Participation with the adoption of P2G2 Model by putting people at the centre of the development process. **b) Jeevan Pramann scheme**; where pensioners can avoid standing in long queues and can avail their pension by the use of biometric credentials based on **Aadhar** are some of the salient examples.

Research be encouraged to create a data baseline for the Governance issues.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/ UTs)

Dovetail Technology in Good Governance Initiatives and in Promotion of Human Rights

3. Technology should be dovetailed in Good Governance initiatives keeping in mind aspirations of the people. Technology is a means of empowering oneself and others. Technology enhances the flow of data. Digital India will enable the government more accessible to people and in making people's ideas and feedback



more accessible to the government. For instance, Social Networking Sites could be used to **create awareness about job opportunities, skill development and sharing of information of good welfare schemes**. Use of **GIS Technology** in imparting citizen services, security and effective delivery system and **e-filing of FDI applications** by Foreign Investment Promotion Board (FIPB).

Today, due to gaps in flow of information, conflicts, physical separation of different departments and the organization stereotypes; there is internal-communication gaps that are widening within the state organizations. The **use of technology** should identify and rectify such issues and attempt to **bridge the inter-departmental gaps** with all organs of Bureaucracy/Administration. The increase in such integration and cohesion between the departments is a key to good governance. There is also a discrepancy between people who have access to resources to use new information and communication tools and people who do not have the resources and access to technology. Such Digital Divide should be bridged for the success of e-governance. Thus, there is a need to promote innovation, 'out of the box' thinking and encourage public participation through online mechanisms.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Swachh Bharat Abhiyan

4. There is a need to raise awareness and change the mindset of people towards cleanliness which could be achieved by self introspection and 'build a culture of safai- in and around us'. Physical cleaning of garbage at both individual and society level at large should be undertaken by dovetailing technology and have innovative cleaning mechanisms. Collection, segregation and disposal of waste at the source with the citizens partnership needs to be highlighted. Have dedicated working hours and encourage '**Shram Daan**' as part of Swachh Bharat Abhiyan. Littering in public spaces be made an offence and have a system of 'Zero Hour' in every school and institutions earmarked towards cleanliness. Incentivize and honour Good Safai karamchari at regular intervals. We need to clean rural areas, towns and big cities by an integrated effort of all stakeholders.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Participatory Decision Making: Including People in Decision Making Loop

5. Human dignity is the fulcrum of human rights. Government should engage with people and encourage them to participate in the policy making & while devising mechanisms for delivery of services impacting their daily lives. People should participate in the decision making processes, which will lead to greater ownership, accountability, competency and respect for law. For example, any policy in the draft format should be widely circulated in the public domain to seek diverse opinions, encourage public consultation and have 360 degree opinion sharing through online mechanisms and state web portals. There should be social, financial and digital inclusion for the success of good governance practices.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)



Good Governance Should not be an Exception but it should be a Rule of Law

6. Good Governance and development initiatives should focus on holistic public participation, inclusive growth, social justice, check menace of corruption and enhance accountability of all stakeholders. We need to have an efficient delivery system and need to bring in systemic changes in the entire system which needs to be aligned with the aspirations of common man. For instance the **Multi source stakeholder feedback (MSF), Transparent processes in Railways, Banks and CPSEs, Formation of Bank Board Bureau (BBB), CPSE Executive and performance appraisals through online APAR** are some of the examples that can be replicated as per the needs of the States.

Transparency, responsiveness, commitment and co-operation of all stakeholders are the fundamental pillars of good governance. There is a need to bring **more awareness about various welfare schemes and flagship programmes** at the grassroot level through the use of Media. Emphasis should be given to make the system more accountable and efficient with the use of technology.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Benchmark for Service Delivery

7. **Benchmarking in all departments of service delivery system should be established and implemented in a time bound manner.** The service delivery by the State shall be through a twofold review of the experience with contracting out of services and performance-based approaches. There shall be full awareness about the services provided by the State and process to evaluate about the quality of services provided. The State can set optimum “benchmark” for all services and departments and make them achievable in a time bound manner. Community mobilization is an effective way of participation and demanding public officials to deliver quality services. Clear responsibility in the system should be fixed at various levels.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Role of Media and Civil Society including NGOs in Raising Awareness of Good Governance Initiatives

8. Media is a force multiplier and an important stakeholder in improving the governance and protection of human rights. To improve the quality of governance, it is essential to point out the loopholes in the procedures, policies and schemes that are already in place, while acknowledging the positive efforts. The media needs to play a proactive role by focusing on facts and presenting a pragmatic and unbiased view on issues affecting our governance. Social media could also be used for monitoring of public work and take the feedback from the public. As conscious citizens, we cannot hope for good governance without civil society’s engagement. A well-functioning democracy needs everyone’s participation and investment. This responsibility of good governance being a general mission of any government makes it imperative to emphasize on and highlight ways for civil society and the government to interact and collaborate to ensure its effective implementation.



The role of the civil society is central to solving large scale complex problems in a sustainable way. The Role of Civil Society in drafting of country reports submitted before the Child Rights Committee in UN is a reflection of such participation. NGOs should be made partners with the Government in designing of development projects.

Thus, all stakeholders should work in a coordinated manner in raising awareness about Good Governance, Development and Human Rights.

(Action: Ministry of Information Technology, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Effective Implementation of Laws

9. There are a lot of Laws protecting the rights of the individuals but more focus should be given on the implementation of these existing laws. The rights guaranteed to our citizens may be self-evident and constitutionally secured but there is a need for effective implementation of laws. There are a large number of laws but there is a wide gap between the implementation of those prevailing laws. The need of the hour is to spread legal literacy and develop an effective enforcement mechanism with effective checks and balances.

(Action: Ministry of Law & Justice, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Speedy Redressal of Grievances through Single Window System

10. The service delivery module should be based on 'single delivery system' and speedy redressal of grievances. This would help in timely delivery and optimum efficiency and simplification of the procedures for common man. This delivery system will be the central point of service delivery, fulfilling the essence of good governance. 'E-District' by the NCT of Delhi, **Umang Application** launched by the Ministry of IT which incorporates all other applications by various Ministries are examples that could be replicated by other states. **Public servants should be made accountable to ensure timely redressal of grievances**, including visible action against the defaulters as per the government rules on the subject.

Single window redressal system should be created which will result in quick delivery of services. Simplified procedures will make technology accessible and affordable to all. Single window system will increase the efficiency through time and cost in dealing with the government. This will make governance better and development faster and would also ensure timely delivery of the services. Single window system will ease out the process of disbursement of pensions, payment of electricity bills and other benefits. The content of the web portal must be uniform, user friendly and easy to access. Initiatives like **SAKALA**, is a success story of Service Delivery Mechanism by Karnataka Government, even the Rajasthan Government has The **Rajasthan Enterprises Single Window Enabling and Clearance Rules, 2011** and such other best practices may be adopted by other States.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/CS of all States/ UTs)



Combating Corruption

11. Corruption adversely affects promotion and protection of human rights. Corruption is a cross-cutting problem which affects all our policies and ultimately affects our governance. Corruption harms all parts of society and deprives them in the worst case of their most fundamental rights, including fair access to health services or education or having a fair trial and investigation. There are laws but these are not implemented. Hence we need to bridge this gap by removing corruption, timely and effective implementation mechanism. Effective actions to fight corruption and ensuring equitable development may be taken. **Prevention of Corruption Act, effective implementation of RTI Act, Digital India, E-governance, Demonetization and formation of Special Investigation Team (SIT)**, to fight black money and corruption are few steps that will greatly help to combat corruption and facilitate holistic development thereby promoting transparency, accountability and equitability.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/ CS of all States/ UTs)

Improvement of Health Care and Infrastructure

12. a) Health Care of all individuals is one of the most important tool of Good Governance. Health initiatives should be such designed so that it is within the reach of the common man. For example, any patient goes to the hospital should be immediately attended by the Doctor, given an empathic hearing about the illness, must inform the patient about the treatment and likely side effects of the medicines. Only essential diagnostic tests should be done and the patient should not be over medicated. These patients should further be given regular follow-up sessions and treatment be recorded properly.
- b) Adequate budget allocation towards holistic health care, including creation of health care infrastructure is needed. At present, less than 2% of GDP is allocated to health sector. Hence, additional funds should be allocated within a short time space of 3-4 years to effectively bridge the gaps.
- c) Create 'digital doctors' with tele-consultation: India is still largely Rural-India. Specialized doctors are not available in many remote parts of the country. This creates a need for tele-consultants. TISS Study shows that 85% of diseases can be detected without the doctor-patient being present in the same premise/location through tele-medicine.
- d) Senior citizens are in need of special care and protection. There should be provisions for the fulfillment of those needs and requirements that are unique to senior citizens. Thus, there should be an exclusive geriatric ward in all the hospitals for elderly population. Specialized doctors and para medical staff in geriatric care should be appointed.

(Action: Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, GOI/ CS of all States/UTs)

Need for Focus on Quality Education

13. Education is the process of facilitating learning, skills, values, beliefs, and habits. Education should focus on the process of learning, acquisition



of knowledge, skills and have values. To enhance the quality of education the following adaptations are required :

- a) Modification of curriculum of education which includes quality infrastructure, quality of teachers and building a culture of human rights is required. Thus, bringing Human rights curriculum not only into colleges but also in the NCERT Curriculum at a primary level holds importance.
- b) Develop teaching/training curriculum for making enabling Apps in structured norms for the school students. This technology should be accessible, affordable and should add value.
- c) Develop technology driven initiatives, which can check/ plug leakage of mid day meal scheme/ ICDS/MNREGEA etc.
- d) The Assam government has launched a unique initiative “Maitre Ek Gyan Yatra” to link primary school to high school to college.

(Action: Ministry of HRD, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Demographic Dividend of India

14. India is at an advantage in terms of demographic dividends as 65% of the population is less than 35 years of age. The youth are energetic, tech-savvy and understand nuances of digital India. Thus, the youth can play a vital role in development of Good Governance and management of change. These young minds should be optimally channelized to promote innovation and out of box thinking. New equation: **India Today + Information Technology= India Tomorrow +India Talent.**

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Encourage Research and Create Data Baseline

15. A data bank of knowledge base system consisting of all government development projects must be created. We have limited research initiatives and there is a need to encourage research and development at all levels and create data which facilitates in policy intervention. New research is essential for finding ways to prevent or mitigate the impact of economic, climate and population changes as well.

More than 93 percent of workers work in the Unorganized Sector and migrate from one State to another State; till now there is the process of registration of the unorganized workers has not started under the Act of 2008. Such workers are not even paid minimum wages and are exploited due to their vulnerability. The Recipient State should register; maintain data of migrant workers working in organized and unorganized sector on an online portal which should be regularly updated by the State.

(Action: Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment/ MoLE, GOI/ CS of all States/UTs)

Creation of Effective Vigilance Committee at the District and Sub-District Level

16. There should be effective vigilance committees at the State, District and Taluka levels to identify, rescue, release, rehabilitate and reintegrate bonded and child labourers into society. The Vigilance Committee shall provide for the economic and social revalidation of the freed labours, to keep an eye on the number of



offences of which cognizance has been taken and to make a survey as to whether there is any offence of which cognizance ought to be taken. Further, there should be counseling and capacity building- training and skill development of released labourers.

Vigilance committees should be fully functional and contact details of all the members with the phone numbers, e-mail details should be uploaded on the State web portal.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Enhance Gender Sensitivity

17. Gender sensitization shall be done to create awareness about the importance of gender sensitivity in organizations, to make the participants understand the measures an organization can take to become gender sensitive and to develop gender sensitivity of participants. Gender sensitive capacity-building initiatives can contribute to poverty reduction and sustainable development for improving the wellbeing of people in the country. To enhance gender sensitivity there is a need to change our mindset and attitudes of the people towards women, gender sensitization programmes should be held in various government offices through sensitization campaigns, training, workshop, programs etc. at regular intervals. For instance, the centrally sponsored scheme of **Rajiv Gandhi Scheme for Empowerment of Adolescent Girls (SABLA)** and its related interventions; **Bhamashah Scheme** by Rajasthan Government and **Ladli Beti Scheme** by the Jammu and Kashmir, **Sukanya Samridhi Yojana which are in line with the 2030 Agenda of SDG**. Moreover, to prevent sexual harassment at workplace, all employers or persons in charge of work place, whether in public or private sector, should take appropriate steps to prevent sexual harassment.

(Action: Ministry of Women and Child Development, GOI)

Automation and Computerization

18. Computerization is not e-governance alone, but application through automation and computerization is e-governance. Automation means the mechanization- and usually the speeding up--of production, not only in manufacturing but also in services, whereas Computerization is an advanced form of automation.

The policy initiatives for e-governance should focus upon enhancing and improving the Central, State and District Level administration. The Modernization of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) including its end-to-end computerization for the Department of Food & Public Distribution (DoF&PD) have been progressive steps towards good governance. All States should incorporate automation and computerization of PDS.

Moreover, through digital technology online surveys should be conducted for effective feedback.

Also, earlier opening of Bank Accounts had a 4-5 pages long application form but now through, KYC- Know your customer- online one page forms can be filled which takes lesser time and makes the life of citizens much easy.

(Action: Ministry of E. & I.T., GOI/CS of all States/UTs)



Capacity Building and Training of all Stakeholders

19. There is a need for developing knowledge economy, enhance infrastructure and capacity building- training of administrative staff at all levels. This training program allows strengthening skills that are needed to improve the knowledge of the administrative staff. This awareness will enable all employees to have similar skills and knowledge conforming to higher standards.

Through the help of civil society, digital bankers, doctors, teachers and NGOs, such awareness and capacity building programmes should be conducted for promoting good governance and human rights. One such example by the Central Government is the **Disha Program** which teaches people how to make use of Digital resources.

(Action: Ministry of E. & I.T. , GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Constitution of State High Power Committee in every States/UTs

20. A State High Power Committee for Good Governance, Development and Human Rights should be constituted in every state under the Chief Secretary. Further, they should meet at regular intervals, preferably at a frequency of three months, to review the progress and follow-up with all the other Government Departments. The High Power Committee will assess, identify, determine and recommend measures for continual improvement of governance. The focus of the committee should be in accordance with the four major principles of good governance i.e. transparency, participation, accountability and responsiveness. This will also promote greater commitment, cooperation and coordination of all the stakeholders.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Corporate Social Responsibility

21. Corporate houses have enormous resources – they should also make efforts to protect and promote good governance initiatives. The corporate ensure that they provide for occupational health safety of employees and promote and protect of their Human Rights through their business operations as well as protect land rights and labour rights of employees. The corporation should ensure timely arrangement and payment of minimum wages and prevent harassment at work place. Corporate social sector must integrate with all stakeholders to promote Good Governance initiatives.

(Action: Ministry of Finance/Commerce and Industry, GOI)

Creation of Institutional Checks and Balances

22. There is an urgent need for checks and balances in our functionality of our institutional mechanisms for preventing fraud, misconduct, criminality and corruption. Creating a monitoring and evaluation board within the institution will help check large scale cases of corruption. Therefore, there is a need to have institutionalized checks and balances in order to maintain transparency and accountability.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)



Police Initiatives

23. Police is a service; the general perception that it is a force needs to change. Police does not violate human rights of people and people should not be scared to go to the police. The attitude should be changed by sensitization programmes.
- Sensitization of all police officials is required for efficient protection and promotion of Human Rights.
 - All FIRs should be uploaded on the website as per the orders of the Supreme Court.
 - Cashless challans should be issued for traffic violations.
 - Prisoners should be treated humanely and their right to dignity to be protected. They should be provided with employment opportunities, rehabilitation facilities etc after their release.
 - There should be capacity building- training and skill development of released prisoners and, in order to not fall back into the vicious cycle there is a need for a proper follow-up mechanism.

(Action: Ministry of Home Affairs, GOI/CS/DGPs/IGPs of all States/UTs)

Regulation of Traffic through Technology

24. There is a need to put in **Intelligent Transportation Systems** referring to the use of technology (computing, communications, and sensors) to optimize the movement of vehicles over transport networks. This optimization covers areas as diverse as traffic signal control, automatic number plate recognition (**ANPR**), and on-line real-time traffic messaging. Moreover the range of cameras should be wider and dynamic. There shall also be Automation of number of number plates, use of Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR) system, to improve identification of traffic rule violations, within a shorter time-frame, and without having to increase number of monitoring personnel. This would also check and reduce the number of road accidents per year.

(Action: Ministry of E. & I.T. , GOI/CS/DGPs/IGPs of all States/UTs)

Cleanliness and Sanitation

25. Cleanliness and sanitation through public participation and making all departments accountable for maintaining high standards of cleanliness. Around 60 percent of Indian population does not have access to safe and private toilets. Such overwhelming majority of those without access to sanitation facilities poses a formidable obstacle in the development of the nation. In this backdrop, we need to address the challenges of clean drinking water, cleaning of rivers, sanitation, and hygiene and ensure success of **National Rural Drinking Water Programme** which provides universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all by 2030.

Further, government should focus on using renewable energy, especially solar and green products which are cost effective, install garbage pits, biogas plants and bulk disposal plants to recycle waste in all urban and rural areas. Ideas



need to be generated to raise widespread awareness and change the mindset and behaviour of the masses towards hygiene and cleanliness. Existing laws and regulations should be made more stringent by imposing fine and penalties for defaulters.

(Action: Ministry of Water and Sanitation, GOI/CS of all States/UTs)

Social Audit

26. Social audits identify the potential and existing beneficiaries to evaluate the implementation of a programme by comparing official records with ground realities. Social audit helps in identification of accurate documents, prioritization of developmental activities, check proper utilization of funds, and confirm the development activity with the stated goals and guarantee quality of service essential for good governance. Thus, making it available at district level will make the governance more effective and transparent.

(Action: CS of all States/UTs)

Fix Timelines and Standardized Procedures

27. A quantum improvement would come only when the Executive, Judiciary, and Legislature would work collectively for promoting good governance and protecting human rights which enables time bound implementation of good governance initiatives and timely disposal of common man's grievances - fix timelines and standardized procedures. Further, there is a need for the change of the mindset and the attitudes of the administrations. The public servants should be self actualized and self motivated.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/ CS of all States/ UTs)

Change of Mindset and Attitudes of all Stakeholders

28. Changes In the attitudes and mindsets of all stakeholders are essential for sustainable development and protection of human rights. Human Dignity is the spine of Human Rights and it should be strongly protected. This change should be in alignment with the aspirations of common man, rule of law and based on equality.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/ CS of all States/ UTs)

Miscellaneous

29. Most of the State governments authorities/agencies remain in a denial mode for issues like Bonded Labour, Child Labour and Trafficking. Sometimes, the denial is on account of the perceptions that acknowledging the existence of such social issues will bring a bad reflection on the image of the state. States should take initiatives to highlight these issues, if existing, as acknowledging such social issues and providing timely relief to aggrieved victims is of utmost importance. Compliance by all the stakeholders, including the States and UTs should be a natural and spontaneous process in a time bound manner.

(Action: All Ministries, GOI/ CS of all States/ UTs)